

## **From *Dedication: Building the Seattle Branches of Mary Baker Eddy's Church, A Centennial Story* by Cindy Safronoff**

*Manuscript excerpt – chapter “Influence and Inspiration (1918)” DRAFT June 17, 2020*

**Author's foreword for this chapter:** When I initially researched and wrote the World War I section of the *Dedication* story, I essentially skipped over 1918. At that time the Spanish influenza pandemic seemed a forgotten chapter of history not relevant to the story focus of cooperative church building. Furthermore, I did not want to research the details of such an unpleasant topic and I was not confident I could do the topic justice. But as I was preparing to publish Part 1 of *Dedication*, the 2020 COVID pandemic began and suddenly the 1918 Spanish flu pandemic was being discussed alongside it in news articles. I looked more closely into the 1918 era of my Christian Science churches in Seattle and gained new insights into how events fit into the chronology of World War 1 events and the 1918 pandemic. I realized that this was the focus immediately prior to the building project for Third Church of Christ, Scientist, where the *Dedication* story began and what launched the local church building boom. During the 2020 shutdown I wrote this chapter of history on 1918 and rewrote two other WWI chapters to fit this one in as the new chapter 26.

Like all my other podcasts and excerpts, this is a draft. Comments are welcome. For more information on the project, please visit my website, [CindySafronoff.com](http://CindySafronoff.com). If you would like to receive future episodes, please subscribe to my podcast.

### **Influence and Inspiration (1918)**

The world war did not stop progress on church building in Seattle. Having purchased a building lot near the main entrance to the University of Washington in March 1918, the members of Third Church of Christ, Scientist, seemed determined to continue moving forward with their construction project. But under the guidance of Orison “O.J.C.” Dutton, Board Chair and President, in April as American troops’ involvement in European battles intensified the board suspended monthly discussion meetings on church building. The church was supporting the special Christian Science ministry activities on military bases known as Camp Welfare, and Mr. Dutton was put in charge of those activities for Third Church. Many members of their church community may have been away supporting war efforts, and the remaining members may have been busier than usual with the usual church work. Church services and their Christian Science Reading Room were operating as normal. But then in the fall of 1918, the Mayor of Seattle required all church activities be suspended because of influenza.<sup>1</sup>

During the fall of 1918 through the winter of 1919, the word influenza had a meaning that conveyed a special terror throughout the world. Merely saying the word struck fear in people’s hearts, because this was not the common seasonal illness. This influenza was a novel virus, a new variant on the usual contagion. It was sometimes referred to as “the grip.” It had unusual symptoms, and it was known to be deadly, not only to the most vulnerable people in society—small children, the elderly, and the malnourished—but to healthy young adults. As the world war entered its fifth year, a pandemic began, triggering another world-wide war being fought within hospitals and homes, an assault on humanity by a mysterious new disease often described as an attack. It was associated with a grip of fear.

A short article later published in the *Christian Science Sentinel* pointed out that influenza is an Italian word meaning influence. Founder of the Christian Science church Reverend Mary Baker Eddy had warned

members against “influencing or being influenced erroneously.” The article by Horace C. Jenkins called “Influence” stated that Eddy’s warning could be creatively interpreted to “mean not to catch or pass on this very erroneous influenza.” Taking this interpretation of influence seriously could bring inspiration and healing, something the whole world desperately needed in 1918 for influenza – and the fear of it.<sup>2</sup>

In Seattle, the first report on the novel virus was published in the back pages of the *Seattle Times* on May 28, 1918. It was a brief dispatch from London about a “mysterious epidemic” in Spain that had spread to “at least 40 per cent of the population” and even the king of Spain was feared to have “fallen a victim to it.” “The symptoms resemble influenza,” the brief article explained, “but many persons afflicted with it have fallen in the streets in a fit.” Because newspapers in neutral Spain were the first to openly report on the outbreak, it became known as the Spanish flu. The disruption and death toll of the world-wide military conflict had been massive, among the most deadly in human history, but the influenza pandemic may have been worse.<sup>3</sup>

This influenza spread rapidly through the military camps and transports. Soldiers who had long endured terrifying hazards of brutal battlefronts quickly succumbed to influenza. As troops returned home, the contagion broke out in their own communities and rapidly spread through every city and town. Ultimately, hundreds of millions of people in nearly every country in the world were affected. What made the Spanish flu especially alarming was the inability of modern medicine to offer effective help to victims. This failure was publicly admitted by the eminent Dr. Victor C. Vaughan, who had been touted by the *Seattle Times* as “one of the most distinguished members of his profession in the country” during one of his recent visits to Seattle.<sup>4</sup>

Dr. Vaughan was early on the scene when this strain of influenza made its deadly debut in America among troops at Camp Devens near Boston. Dr. Vaughan was in charge of the communicable disease section of the Surgeon General office of the US Army during the world war. He had faced many types of epidemics in many military camps, both during the current war and previously as a military doctor during the Spanish-American war. His medical expertise was *Epidemiology and Public Health*, the title of the two-volume book he later authored. During peacetime at the University of Michigan Medical School where he was Dean of medical faculty, the nationally-known physician established several medical journals, published prolifically on his medical research, and served as President of the American Association of Physicians and the American Medical Association. Statements by such a pillar of the medical field carried weight. Vaughan had been an early advocate of the theory of disease that microscopic organisms known as germs cause communicable disease through physical transmission. Germ theory represented the most advanced application of science to medicine. From his study of Spanish flu mortality rates, he came to a very alarming conclusion: “If the epidemic continues its mathematical rate of acceleration, civilization could easily disappear from the face of the earth.” Medical science provided dire predictions but little practical help in the life and death battles going on in the hospitals. He famously said, “The saddest part of my life was when I witnessed the hundreds of deaths of the soldiers in the army camps and did not know what to do. At that moment I decided never again to prate about the great achievements of medical science, and to humbly admit our dense ignorance in this case.” Vaughan’s experience with the Spanish flu, according to one account, “compelled him to question his very faith in medical science.”<sup>5 6</sup>

As the influenza epidemic spread across the United States in the fall of 1918, government authorities faced unprecedented challenges with few guidelines and little time to prepare. New public health rules were published regarding air circulation, personal hygiene, and prohibiting public crowding. Emergency

hospitals were set up to handle the surge in patients, quarantines were imposed on entire military bases and cities, in some places regulation surgical masks were required when going outside the home. Public venues were shut down in a desperate attempt to prevent contagion. In some cities special police squads were tasked with enforcing the health rules. These were serious matters concerning public health, because doctors were making little progress in curing patients.

While medical practitioners were at a loss as to how to treat Spanish flu, Christian Science practitioners were confident in their solution, not only for prevention and cure of the disease for individuals, but to bring about the end of the epidemic. Although Rev. Eddy had been gone for eight years, they still had her writings to consult. In 1906 she had written an article called “Personal Contagion,” which began:

At a time of contagious disease, Christian Scientists endeavor to rise in consciousness to the true sense of the omnipotence of Life, Truth, and Love, and this great fact in Christian Science realized will stop a contagion.<sup>7</sup>

To the Christian Science practitioner, the treatment of Spanish flu was no different than treatment of any other problem, except for the intensity of the fear surrounding it. Eliminating fear is an important aspect of Christian Science treatment. Normally healing work is done privately, between practitioner and patient, but in the case of the pandemic, because the newspapers were a significant factor in conveying fear, Christian Scientists mounted a public relations campaign to elevate collective consciousness. They took their spiritual teachings on contagion to the general public more assertively than ever before to address the fear that was gripping the world. To their world view it would impact not only the work of Christian Science practitioners but even those under medical care. Eddy had earlier written in an article called “Contagion,” “If only the people would believe that good is more contagious than evil, since God is omnipresence, how much more certain would be the doctor’s success. . . .” Through this outreach, Christian Scientists publicly challenged the medical system, which claimed to have all the answers but clearly did not. They specifically challenged germ theory. After so many years of having to defend against lobbyists working to outlaw the healing practice of Christian Science on the claim of its inferiority to medical treatment, the pandemic gave Christian Scientists a kind of public relations opportunity that supported their view of what would bring about an end to the pandemic. Dr. Vaughan’s public statement on the “dense ignorance” of medical science in facing the influenza pandemic was a potent statement to quote in letters to newspaper editors. To scoffers at the healing claims of Christian Science, this campaign might have seemed ridiculous, futile, even infuriating. Even some Christian Scientists may have privately disagreed with the media tactic taken by the Christian Science Publishing Society. But the message conveyed had its supporters, including people with medical credentials who were willing to speak out publicly. One such person willing to challenge germ theory was Dr. H. Walton Hubbard, of Spokane, Washington.<sup>8</sup>

Dr. Hubbard had a successful medical practice for nine years before he changed his approach to the treatment of disease. Even while he was in medical school he concluded that there was a “mental factor in disease which was almost if not entirely ignored by the medical profession.” When he began his medical practice, he further explored this idea. He hypothesized that at least some diseases have at least some mental influence. With time and experience, he classified more and more diseases as mental. Eventually he concluded that *all* diseases had “a mental origin.” His exploration had nothing to do with Christian Science, and in fact, he had not even considered it. But as he saw more evidence of mental influence on disease, he began studying all the books he could find on mental healing, including *Science and Health with Key to the Scriptures* by Mary Baker Eddy, the textbook of Christian Science. He concluded that

Eddy's healing system was completely different from all the others because "Christian Science does not depend on any power inherent in the human mind, but draws all of its power from a divine source above the human mind." For five years he continued his medical practice and continued studying Christian Science. He witnessed healings as a result of prayer "where the evidence couldn't be questioned." He saw "cases which were hopelessly incurable from a medical standpoint perfectly and permanently healed through the application of [Christian] Science." Even with this, however, he did not immediately accept it. "On the contrary," he later explained, "...it quite alarmed me! . . . I had devoted many years of time and effort in becoming a physician and in acquiring a busy and successful practice, and I saw that to accept Christian Science it would be necessary for me to give up the practice of medicine, and nothing was farther from my mind at that time." But when his own son's life was in mortal danger from disease, he relied on prayer. By simply applying what he had learned from his reading of Eddy's book he successfully healed his infant son of a severe case of diphtheria for which medical means had nothing more to offer and there was little hope of recovery. As he gained more experience in healing, he concluded that the results of Christian Science treatment were "incomparably better" than medical care. Gradually he lost all confidence in material medicine. Eventually, he gave up his medical practice to become a Christian Science practitioner—following the footsteps of Drs. Francis J. Fluno, Abraham A. Sulzer, and John M. Tutt, who all gave up successful medical practices to become Christian Science practitioners, teachers, and lecturers. Hubbard continued to have kind feelings for medical doctors and recognized their unselfish efforts to alleviate sickness and suffering. He remained sympathetic to doctors who opposed the practice of Christian Science, but nonetheless Hubbard became an outspoken critic of germ theory.<sup>9</sup>

Dr. Hubbard shared his new views through lectures starting in 1916 when he was appointed to the Christian Science Board of Lectureship, which brought him from Spokane to Seattle and all over North America before and during the pandemic. He was quoted by Christian Scientists in letters to newspaper editors, such as this one by Robert G. Steel in the *Grand Rapids News*, reprinted in the *Christian Science Sentinel*:

[The] statement that "the germ theory of disease is as firmly established as the principle of mathematics" would be at once startling and disconcerting if it were true. It is a man made theory, purely and simply, and is refuted by very many eminent medical men and investigators. Dr. John B. Fraser of Toronto conducted one hundred and thirty-three experiments with various kinds of disease germs (nineteen with germs of pneumonia), in attempts to [produce] the disease in human beings from the germs. In no case was he successful, and his conclusion was that while germs may be the product of disease they are decidedly not its cause. Dr. Walton Hubbard states the case very nicely when he says that because polliwogs are in a mud puddle, it does not prove that the polliwogs made the puddle, since they are there because it is a good place for polliwogs. The biochemists have repeatedly shown the fallacy of the germ idea, and have proved that while it may be a very pretty speculative theory, it is very far removed from a scientific fact. A medical theory of to-day becomes a medical fact tomorrow and a medical discard the next day, and so the change goes on as it has constantly done throughout almost forty centuries of medical history. . . . There are very many noble, self-sacrificing men in the medical profession who have performed herculean services during the prevalence of the epidemic. Unfortunately their efforts have been circumscribed by the limitations of matter, and matter has always proved a broken reed in times of stress.<sup>10</sup>

Peter V. Ross in a letter to *The Enquirer* in San Francisco after using Dr. Vaughan's "dense ignorance" quote went on to say:

[I]t is interesting to note that Dr. F. L. Kelly, of the state bacteriological laboratory at the University of California declares that "we do not know anything more about the disease to-day than we did one hundred years ago; there is no known cure or preventative." Of course no one blames physicians for not understanding the influenza, but the average person is wondering why he should be delivered into the hands of health officers and be forced to submit to masks and other indignities when it is admitted that such officers do not know how to cure or prevent the disease, and in fact stand helpless in its presence.<sup>11</sup>

The *Christian Science Sentinel* reprinted a news article from the *Oakland Enquirer* about experiments at Goat Island by Naval doctors studying the influenza germ. The story told was that fifty sailors volunteered for an experiment where they were exposed to flu germs in every way believed to cause the disease so the medical staff could study the transmission and development of the disease in their laboratory. The article concluded:

But no cases developed among these fifty sailors! . . . The medical men confessed themselves baffled. All their ideas of the disease were turned topsy-turvy. . . . The doctors are still wondering. The explanation, however, is simplicity itself, for it was proved by each one of these fifty young men. The fifty young men volunteered to act as subjects upon which to be experimented. This showed clearly that they did not fear the disease . . . . [T]hey could not acquire what they did not fear. Since their fear of the disease was gone, the disease was absolutely nonexistent, even though every effort was made to force it on them. . . . Medical men are now acknowledging this condition. They are the first to tell patients to eliminate fear. When this is done, their work is done. There would be no cases of influenza if every person in the state would do as these fifty Goat Island sailors did; namely, eliminate fear of the disease.<sup>12</sup>

A similar article on the Goat Island experiments from the Cleveland *Plain Dealer* was also reprinted in the *Sentinel*, as well as commentary from the *New York Herald* on a similar experiment in Boston which not only failed to produce disease among the volunteers, but also failed to produce an effective vaccine from the blood of people who had recovered.<sup>13</sup>

The theory of immunity through fearlessness was put to the test by Christian Scientists during the pandemic according to several stories briefly mentioned in the Christian Science periodicals. In Spokane, the largest city in rural eastern Washington, many in the city became sick, despite Spokane's chief public health officer Dr. John Anderson ruling the city with "an iron, health-minded fist." Anderson strictly banned all gatherings, public or private, indoor or outdoor, small or large, and required use of surgical masks in public, yet there were so many influenza cases they opened an emergency hospital at the 50-room Lion Hotel downtown at First and Lincoln Streets near the Deaconess Hospital. Spokane had a strong and active Christian Science community centered a few blocks away in the Hutton Building at First and Washington, where they had a joint Christian Science Reading Room and Dr. Hubbard and several other practitioners had offices. In years past they had hosted Christian Science lectures by both Dr. Fluno and Dr. Sulzer. The local influence of these former medical doctors may have given Christian Scientists in Spokane a special confidence in their disbelief of germ theory. The local Christian Scientists petitioned the city to be able to continue holding services at their two local churches on the grounds that they were "engaged in the healing of the sick." Their request made the local news when it was denied on the grounds that the city "could not consider the character or purpose of a meeting but prohibited all

meetings, no matter what their object." Meanwhile, the hospital at the local military base, Fort George Wright, was overwhelmed with suffering soldiers. There was a shortage of nurses, the available nurses were exhausted, sometimes having to work around the clock with no rest, and many became sick themselves. Urgent public appeals were made for any available nurse to come to help. According to Dr. Hubbard, "an appeal was made to the Christian Scientists in the community, because they were the only ones who were unafraid." They did come to help, "scrubbing floors and doing any work that needed to be done. They kept the hospital in operation, and they did not get influenza." The former medical doctor concluded, "Their consciousness of divine Love destroyed the belief of contagion and proved that Love triumphs over fear." A Red Cross director formally thanked the Christian Scientists "for the splendid aid rendered during the Emergency Epidemic" at the Fort George Wright hospital.<sup>14</sup>

A similar story was told by Mr. Steel about a Naval Training Station in Great Lakes, Illinois, where he said the company commander asked any Christian Scientists to step forward to volunteer to work as nurses in the hospital and they did so without contracting influenza. Zona Marie Carruthers shared her personal experience as a nurse at the Camp Mills Army base in Mineola, New York, where there were more than 4,200 cases of influenza, overwhelming the medical staff and overflowing the hospitals into 50 additional tent wards erected to handle the emergency. Ms. Carruthers wrote:

When the Government called for nurses in 1918 I was ordered to join the Army Nursing Corps at Camp Mills, Long Island, where I stayed one year. Every day, Christian Science proved to be a constant help to me; and during the epidemic I was so grateful to be helping, not only with my hands, but with right thoughts; for through knowing the truth I was able to help my coworkers and those who were struggling with sickness and sore grief. Later I became a Christian Science nurse.<sup>15</sup>

Myra Atkinson of Ranger, Texas, claimed to have been the only nurse unaffected in the hospital where she worked. Mrs. Atkinson attributed her protection from contagion to the help of a Christian Science practitioner. Mary E. Moser was one of many Christian Scientists who nursed patients in private homes. Miss Moser shared:

...I helped to nurse five who were afflicted in my sister's home. Protection was given me through this trying time, and I learned something of the unreality of disease and how to bar my thought against its entrance. I am very grateful for the loving help and guidance of the practitioner during these experiences . . .<sup>16</sup>

The Christian Science Publishing Society claimed a "great mass of evidence accumulated to show the physical healings" of disease, including influenza, by Christian Science Camp Worker and soldiers in its publication *Christian Science War Time Activities*. One of many letters from Camp Workers stated:

One of the things for which we are most grateful is the fact that our boys were able to help the others during the recent epidemic. One of them had charge of thirty-six others. The first night he went to each patient and tried to allay his fear and to reassure him. The doctors soon began to turn to him and he was put into a position of considerable responsibility and usefulness.<sup>17</sup>

At the Portsmouth Naval Yard in Portsmouth, Virginia, a camp welfare worker arrived when the influenza was at its peak.

Upon reporting to the Commandant, it was learned that that hospital was congested, and there was a shortage of nurses, due to sickness and recent detachments, creating a serious situation. The services of the Worker were volunteered and accepted, and in the hospital spiritual work

was combined with the material care of sick nurses and men in the influenza wards. Wards of terror-stricken men, witnessing the deaths of comrades, were calmed and encouraged, and many patients thought to be very ill were found up and dressed the next day. Sick nurses stopped taking medicine and in some cases requested the [Christian Science] textbook. The death rate at once diminished and in twenty-four hours reached the zero mark.<sup>18</sup>

To the Christian Scientists, who were working to stop the epidemic by elevating human consciousness above fear to the omnipotence of God, church services supported protection of life. When Boston health officials recommended bans on gatherings, the Board of Directors of The First Church of Christ, Scientist, in Boston, The Mother Church, issued official statements of disagreement. In the same spirit, Bicknell Young, First Reader at The Mother Church, wrote to the *Boston Herald*:

The utterly helpless attitude of the health authorities and physicians generally seems to indicate that they are hopeless to overcome the disease, and are convinced that it must run its course and wear itself out. Those who look beyond matter for the cause and cure of disease see that the great need of the hour is pure Christianity, and yet at the very time when the gospel of Christ in all its practical strength and helpfulness is most needed it is proposed to close the churches.<sup>19</sup>

On October 8, just as health officials across the country were implementing police-enforced bans on public gatherings, *The Christian Science Monitor* published an editorial intended “to help stem the tide of fear which is the most serious factor in perpetuating the present epidemic”:

Fear is the most prolific source of all evil. Of course if fear were understood in its full metaphysical significance, it would be understood to be the provoking cause of all evil of every sort. But even from the ordinary point of view of the world, fear, when it communicates itself to numbers, is capable of causing greater disaster than any other phase of the human consciousness. . . . Some day the world will come to see that what it calls contagion is a mental contagion, and that what it calls infection is the infection of one mind from another. Orthodox medical practice today largely recognizes this, but it draws back from the logical consequences of its own admission, and endeavors to shelter itself in a halfway-house, which is built partially out of mind and partially out of matter. . . . Let any person who has been brought in contact with the conditions of today ask himself frankly whether it is not fear which is playing such fearful havoc in the world. Everywhere men and women are afraid. Afraid in the areas of war of a storm blast that may at any moment strike over them; afraid within the orbit of the air squadrons of the sound of the terrible engines whirring in the darkness overhead, and of hearing the bombs explode all around; boys sleeping fearfully in the trenches, waiting for the summons in the gray morning to go over the top, and men and women sleeping in towns and villages, miles and thousands of miles away, fearful of what in that very moment may be happening to those they love; men and women at sea, waiting as it were for the explosion of torpedoes; or even men and women in immediate physical safety, wondering what effect the war is going to have on their incomes and their lives. A great fear has stricken the world, and it is little wonder if out of this fear there have emerged pestilences and diseases which have mounted on the winds of fear, and scattered their seeds in every direction. In such circumstances what would it be expected that a Christian community should do? . . . [S]hould it not naturally fling wider open the doors of the churches, confident that in doing right, by worshipping God, no ill could touch it? . . . The church which closes its doors practically proclaims its impotency, and the admission is a terrible one when it is made in the hour of a nation’s need.<sup>20</sup>

The *Monitor* concluded its editorial with the classic theatrical line, "Surely it was a wise man who once said, 'A mad world, my masters!'" Its conclusion was emphasized with the provocative headline, "A Mad World." This editorial was reprinted in major newspapers. An explanatory note added, "It is hoped that by recalling to the community the power of Christian prayer to stop the ravages of disease the necessity of opening the churches will be seen and that their opening will be demanded, thus proving that the facts do not belie the statement upon the coinage of the Nation: 'In God We Trust.'"<sup>21</sup>

The *Monitor* editorial received some negative reactions, perhaps surprisingly, or perhaps unsurprisingly, from Christian clergy who supported the health bans on church services. This provided opportunity for a round of response letters, like this one by Steel in the *Grand Rapids News*, later reprinted in the *Christian Science Sentinel*:

Rarely is one allowed the doubtful privilege of reading a letter from the pen of a minister of the gospel so replete with statements which dishonor God, discredit Christ Jesus, and repudiate the whole Bible, as the one which appeared in a recent issue attacking the editorial, "A Mad World," reprinted from *The Christian Science Monitor*.

It is the height of absurdity that after nineteen centuries of Christian teaching and in the most thoroughly Christianized nation in the world, the churches should be closed because of the fear of a so-called epidemic and the foolish belief that the power of God has suddenly become less than that of a microbe.<sup>22</sup>

In the same spirit, a letter by John M. Dean first published in *The News Scimitar* in Memphis, Tennessee, included this challenge to the churches:

. . . If the Bible is true, the house of God should be preeminently a place of safety, and now is the time of times to test it. Is an all-powerful God powerless against disease microbes, and can they take possession of the churches to His exclusion? Is Christianity good for fair weather but not for foul, and must prayer be understood as mere lip service? If this is true—if prayer is unavailing and God is not "a very present help in trouble"—the world would suffer no loss if the churches were to remain closed permanently.<sup>23</sup>

Another opportunity for challenging germ theory presented itself in the virtual endorsement of the Christian Science approach by the influenza public health committee in Des Moines, Iowa, near the hard-hit military base Camp Dodge. Emphasizing a message similar to what U.S. President Franklin D. Roosevelt would one day tell the nation, that "the only thing we have to fear is fear itself," an article from the *Monitor* sent to newspaper rooms throughout the country blamed fear for the spread of influenza and suggested that the fearless Christian Scientists at Camp Dodge had proven their immunity. The Des Moines public health committee was comprised of the former Mayor, the superintendent of schools, the secretary of the Chamber of Commerce, the president of the trades and labor assembly, a pharmacist, and three medical doctors, and it was chaired by the acting health officer for Des Moines, city sanitarian, Dr. William C. Witte. Dr. Witte was quoted as saying:

Many people have thought themselves into their graves. When one continually thinks that he has Spanish influenza or any other disease . . . then, it is quite probable he will, because he has not the right attitude of mind. . . There is no question, that by a right attitude of mind these people have kept themselves from illness. . . . Fear is the first thing to be overcome, the first step in conquering this epidemic. I am not a Christian Scientist, but I believe an application of their principles will



materially aid in preserving the health of the community. They did not originate with the [Christian] Scientists, but are to be found by anyone who will take the trouble to read his Bible.<sup>24</sup>

Attorney Howard W. Byers, Corporation Counsel for Des Moines, recommended “that newspapers prepare editorials citing the immunity which Christian Scientists enjoy from influenza, and urging the use of common sense and a calm attitude of mind in conquering fear of infection.” That recommendation “was indorsed by the committee as a whole, and newspapers were asked to quote the committee to that effect.” Mr. Byers added, “I would recommend that if anything be printed in regard to the disease it be confined to simple preventive measures—something constructive, rather than destructive.”<sup>25</sup>

Byers’ recommendation was in line with the teachings of Eddy, who founded *The Christian Science Monitor* in 1908 to raise the standard of journalism, and who had offered commentary on the harmful power of mental suggestion that newspapers wielded over the general public long before the 1918 pandemic:

Many a hopeless case of disease is induced . . . not from infection nor from contact with material virus, but from the fear of the disease and from the image brought before the mind; it is a mental state, which is afterwards outlined on the body. The press unwittingly sends forth many sorrows and diseases among the human family. It does this by giving names to diseases and by printing long descriptions which mirror images of disease distinctly in thought. . . . A minutely described disease costs many a man his earthly days of comfort. What a price for human knowledge! . . .

Looking over the newspapers of the day, one naturally reflects that it is dangerous to live, so loaded with disease seems the very air. These descriptions carry fears to many minds, to be depicted in some future time upon the body. . .

We should master fear, instead of cultivating it.<sup>26</sup>

Newspapers throughout the country reprinted the *Monitor’s* Camp Dodge article under their own headlines, such as “Fear Responsible for Spread of Influenza,” “Anti Fear Campaign Urged by [Christian] Scientists,” and “Quit Thinking about Influenza.” The Camp Dodge story and the Des Moines health committee were further quoted in letters to newspaper editors reprinted in the *Sentinel*, assuring that Christian Scientists everywhere got the message. Meanwhile, a wave of appeals, pleas, and protests arose throughout the country as bans on church services were imposed by cities and states on their citizens. Special indignation was expressed when churches were forced to close but taverns were allowed to continue operating—consumption of alcohol apparently having been deemed a more essential business than the spiritual uplift of religious worship. An advertisement paid for by Christian Science Churches of Oregon, quoted the *Monitor* editorial and Dr. Witte to make their plea to the general public:

[A]t the very moment when the churches should be filling the minds of the people with peace and reassuring them of the impotence of evil, it is proposed that these churches shall be shut, and that the admission be made that it is dangerous for men and women to congregate to worship God for fear the Lord’s arm is so shortened that He cannot contend with microbes. . . . Let the church doors be opened and unobstructed worship proceed in a Christian land.<sup>27</sup>

Appealing to a higher sense of law, at least one Christian Science branch church challenged as unconstitutional the local laws banning church services. In Los Angeles, when the Mayor banned all public gatherings, all Churches of Christ, Scientist, in the city united in protest of “disease . . . being so industriously promoted through . . . mesmeric fear” and in a petition to the city council to be allowed to resume holding services in support of the need “for the dissemination of a universal understanding of

omnipotent Divine power, reliance upon which effectually aids in destroying the dread of contagion.” Similar petitions were made in other cities. As the Christian Scientists in Portland, Oregon, explained:

The efficacy of Christian Science to prevent and heal disease is universally accepted. Christian Scientists know that they can be of greater service in overcoming the wave of fear now sweeping over this country, by maintaining their regular services.<sup>28 29</sup>

Like Spokane, Los Angeles had a special connection with medical doctors turned Christian Scientists, since both Dr. Fluno and Dr. Sulcer practiced and taught in California. After the petition in Los Angeles was rejected, Ninth Church of Christ, Scientist, on South New Hampshire Street announced its intention to challenge the ban by holding church services on Sunday, November 3. In response, Mayor Frederick T. Woodman warned that the strictest interpretation of the closure law would be enforced. Mayor Woodman publicly declared:

I want it distinctly understood that, while I have every respect for religious organizations, I also have every respect for the laws I am charged to see enforced. . . . [T]he chief of police will have a force of policemen at every Christian Science church door tomorrow with orders to see that those doors are not opened to any gathering for services or for any other purpose.<sup>30 31</sup>

That Sunday, the board members entered the Ninth Church edifice three hours before the service time. They held a private conference while a crowd of people gathered outside and a parade of hundreds of cars, “travelling in a slow stream, drove past the building and vicinity.” Right at 11 o’clock the church doors were unlocked and a few people quietly entered the building. The police responded as directed. The five board members, all prominent members of Los Angeles society, were “technically arrested” on charges of violating a health ordinance. All were immediately released except board chair Harry P. Hitchcock, who declined to pay \$5 for bail and so was held in custody of the jailer until the hearing the next morning. Mr. Hitchcock was following the legal strategy devised by Judge Robert M. Clark, legal counsel for the Christian Scientists. It was intended to expedite a constitutional ruling on the Ninth Church case by taking this test case to the California State Supreme Court and then immediately on to the U.S. Supreme Court. However, they never had their day in court in Washington, D.C., because their hearing was delayed until after the closing order was rescinded. Ninth Church nonetheless made an impact. The dramatic story made the front page of the *Los Angeles Times* and it made the news in places like Seattle. Christian Scientists throughout the world would read about it over the next few months in the *Christian Science Sentinel*.<sup>32 33</sup>

In Evanston, Illinois, near Chicago, where according to a report from Ernest C. Moses in the *Sentinel*, churches were ordered to close but other public places were allowed to remain in operation, another Christian Science church challenged the ban by holding services. As to their desire “to test the legality of the restriction,” Mr. Moses explained:

Christian Scientists . . . are not without sympathy for the health authorities in their endeavors to meet epidemics of fear and disease; for they recognize the difficulties which the officials encounter, and would aid rather than obstruct every right measure. I am sure that your citizens who are Christian Scientists will, with good will and regard for their neighbors, gladly work for better health in Evanston and cheerfully cooperate with civil requirements based on the law rightly constituted and administered.<sup>34</sup>

It was not only the Christian Scientists protesting and challenging the bans. Churches of other denominations responded in a variety of ways. Episcopal churches in Pennsylvania united in a public

statement of disagreement. A Catholic minister made national news for a \$50 court fine for conducting church services in defiance of the ban.<sup>35</sup>

Instead of engaging with police, attorneys, and courts, many Christian Scientists protested through prayer and spiritual study. Maude M. Greene shared her personal story of how the bans caused her to elevate her thinking about church:

When the order came that, on account of an epidemic situation, all churches must be closed, I experienced a considerable sense of resentment and rebellion. . . . As is invariably the case with students of Christian Science, refuge was sought in the textbook, "Science and Health with Key to the Scriptures," and on page 583 was found the definition of church. I supposed that I already knew a good deal about this definition, but soon discovered that I had only made a beginning. As I read the familiar words, "The structure of Truth and Love; whatever rests upon and proceeds from divine Principle," there came like a flash the realization that no one ever had been or ever could be deprived of "the structure of Truth and Love;" that this structure is a divine idea always present in the spiritual consciousness of man; that church is something vital in one's own consciousness, and something of which he can never be deprived. The doors of this structure have never been and can never be closed; they are forever and eternally open; no "ban" ever has been or ever can be put upon that which "rests upon and proceeds from divine Principle," for it is the expression of eternal, unchanging, ever present, ever operative law, that law which forever denies and casts out utterly the belief of disease of any name or nature. . . . Then I appreciated, as never before, the fact that the Christian Science church, as it stands to-day, represents that divine manifestation which the spiritual concept of church has brought to mankind; that it is the expression of that concept improved and bettered in human consciousness because of the activity and law of the right idea of church.

In "great gladness of heart," Ms. Greene, alone at home, read through the list of citations from the Bible and Eddy's writings that comprise the Sunday sermons in all Christian Science churches, which are published in advance for individual study. Her view of church changed. She explained:

[R]ight there the church service was held in its entirety, and its doors were open wide. . . . it was an indescribable joy to know that I was taking the healing activity of this church with me, and there came into my experience a higher and holier sense of church membership than I had ever known, and it was impressed upon me that I could only really "belong" to the Church of Christ, Scientist, as it first belonged to me,— was really a part of me. The experience meant much, for I repeatedly saw this consciousness of church cast out the devils of fear and of an epidemic disease.<sup>36</sup>

The kind of prayerful protest illustrated by Greene may have been the predominate one taken by Christian Scientists in Seattle. City officials in Seattle had the benefit of learning from the experience of early hotspots like Boston. On September 28, 1918, the Washington State Board of Health met in Spokane to discuss the situation and how to prevent a local epidemic. Washington's State Health Commissioner, Dr. Thomas D. Tuttle, shared what he had learned from a meeting of health authorities in Chicago:

The outstanding feature of discussion . . . was the evidence that whatever efforts were made the spread of the disease was only retarded and not prevented. As one health officer very aptly expressed the situation: 'One can avoid contracting the disease if he will go into a hole and stay

there, but the question is how long would he have to stay there? The indications are that it would be at least for a year or longer.<sup>137</sup>

As a practical matter, even in Washington, even with six weeks of warning, it seemed the best they could expect was to try to flatten the mathematical curve predicted by epidemiologists. But before local health board officials could take preventative action there were local cases. Within days after the Spokane conference the first Spanish flu death in the state was reported in Seattle at the University of Washington's Naval Training Station on Portage Bay along with 650 new cases. The following week, Camp Lewis near Tacoma reported 100 cases and the Naval Shipyard in Bremerton reported several hundred more. When the announcement came out in the *Seattle Times* on Saturday evening, October 5, that by order of Mayor Ole Hanson, Board of Health official Dr. J. S. McBride, and Chief of Police J. F. Warren all public gatherings were banned until further orders, it was stated as being necessary to protect not only the general public but also "the army of men working in the shipyards and on other war work." The closure order was drastic, but it was a "patriotic duty" to ensure that the epidemic did not affect the local military production needed to win the war. Dr. Tuttle's emphasis was on prevention, a simple thing if the order were supported by "the intelligent and conscientious cooperation of every citizen."<sup>38</sup>

The Seattle closure order was not without controversy, however. The Superintendent of Schools objected to closing schools and Corporation Counsel W. F. Meier questioned the legal basis of such an order. Regardless of objections, Mayor Hanson was prepared to enforce the order. An "Influenza Squad" of police was charged with breaking up crowds and enforcing the ban on spitting. Initially churches were allowed to hold services outdoors, a concession that seemed to satisfy local religious leaders. A spokesman for the city's Protestant clergy, declared that "Seattle churches unhesitatingly will obey the mandate barring the usual indoor church services. . . . I don't believe there will be any insurgents." Rev. Edward J. O'Dea, Catholic bishop of Seattle, announced that all the city's Catholic churches would hold open-air mass. Officers of Christian Science churches "expressed their intention to comply cheerfully with the closing edict," a sentiment voiced by Florence Lewis, clerk of Fourth Church of Christ, Scientist. Miss Lewis was quoted by the *Seattle Times* as stating, "Christian Scientists are, first of all, obedient to the laws of the land, and it will be our loving duty to comply in all the particulars with the requests of the city officers."<sup>39</sup>

The two largest open-air services in the city were held by First Presbyterian Church and St. James Cathedral. Rev. Dr. Mark A. Matthews, the Presbyterian pastor, planned a "great patriotic-religious gathering" with special music from an army singing squad and a naval band on the south side of their church on Seventh Avenue between Spring and Madison Streets. But the gathering turned out to be "rather small," probably because of the short notice, Rev. Matthews said. It rained that Sunday morning. It was impossible to play any instruments in such cold, wet weather and the song leader for the program was unable to sing. The Catholics turned out en masse for open-air mass at Seattle parishes. The "common thought" among Catholic adherents "was that more severe scourges and prohibitions . . . had failed for centuries to stop the divine services of the Catholic Church." At St. James Cathedral, which held seven hourly masses that day, as reported in the *Catholic Northwest Progress*:

[A]ttendance ran from a couple of hundred to a thousand souls. . . . Seats had been arranged to accommodate all, lights were strung from tree to tree, and the superb Catholic choir filled the air with sacred music to the accompaniment of an organ. While bared heads bowed in the falling rain at the tinkling sanctus bell, the non-Catholic spectators looked on and wondered. It was beyond their comprehension.<sup>40</sup>

Masses were kept short that cold morning because, as reported by *The Seattle Times*, “the clergy did not want to keep the members standing in the wet for any length of time.” Protestant Church leaders were hopeful that with more advance notice more churches could organize outdoor services and attendance would be higher. But they did not have that opportunity because that week the Mayor banned even outdoor church services. This apparently triggered a negative response by local religious leaders. As reported by the *Seattle Star*:

Scores of clergymen from different city districts have laid siege to the offices of the city health physicians with requests to be allowed to address their congregations under the dome of heaven, and been refused. Dr. McBride saying, “Religion that won’t keep for two weeks to save people’s lives isn’t worth having.”<sup>41</sup>

If Board Chair and President O.J.C. Dutton at Third Church of Christ, Scientist, in Seattle even entertained any discussions about holding open-air services, it was never mentioned in the board or membership minutes. It is hard to imagine Christian Scientists in Seattle wanting to stand in the cold autumn rain to hear their Bible Lesson read aloud when they could read it for themselves at home as Greene had done. Nor did Mr. Dutton entertain any challenging to the ban. The *Seattle Times* did not publish the article about Camp Dodge, the *Christian Science Monitor*’s editorial, nor any letters challenging germ theory. What was in the local news besides assurance of cheerful compliance with health rules, was Dutton’s latest organizational initiative, the “Christian Science Soldiers’ and Sailors Hospitality Club.”

Dutton was in charge of a Chamber of Commerce volunteer effort to find affordable housing in Seattle for war industry workers. His appointment to “take charge of the Camp Welfare Work” for Third Church resulted in a similar effort. His Hospitality Club project was to provide beds for Christian Scientists in the military. On Sunday, September 29, Dutton held an afternoon meeting at the Metropolitan Theatre to “present to Christian Scientists and their friends plans for a soldiers’ and sailors’ hospitality club soon to be opened in Seattle.” The project was officially independent of the Christian Science churches, a point that was repeatedly emphasized. With financial support from individuals, Dutton secured the second and third floors of a downtown building on Fourth Avenue at Pine Street. The space, which had been “unoccupied for some time,” was remodeled to provide a large hospitality room for entertainment and providing job placement services for discharged military men, a room for quiet reading and writing, and a dormitory with 200 beds, for “night-and-day operation.” Furnished with donated items, it was “a simple, plain, comfortable place, as homelike as possible.” Administrative headquarters for the operation were in the Empire Building, where the joint Christian Science Reading Room was located, at least sixteen Christian Science practitioners had their offices, and where so many other Christian Science church activities were based.<sup>42</sup>

When Dutton initiated the hospitality club, he may not have realized what life and death risks he would face. Even before the club opened, while he inspected the unfinished space with the city sanitary engineer and fire marshal he had a brush with death. The *Seattle Times* reported that two gun shots in quick succession were fired from an unidentified man in a nearby hotel. The shots “fired pointblank” went through the windows on the street side, the bullets “passed about a foot above the heads of the three men,” left the building through windows on the alley side, hit the brick wall of the adjacent building, then fell to the ground. But this dangerous incident paled in comparison to the epidemic that arrived in Seattle just as the Christian Science club was preparing to open. However Dutton handled management of the hospitality club, he must have faced many challenges, and perhaps many brushes with death. It is probably safe to assume that like so many others he was praying daily with Psalm 91, finding comfort

and confidence in the Bible's promise of deliverance from both "the arrow that flieth by day" and "the noisome pestilence" through trust in omnipotent God, as the Psalmist wrote: "Because thou hast made the Lord, which is my refuge, even the most High, thy habitation; There shall no evil befall thee, neither shall any plague come nigh thy dwelling." (Ps 91:3, 5, 9-10) The club was in operation for eighteen weeks—essentially the same period as the pandemic. During those four and a half months, according to the *Seattle Times* the club accommodated 6,850 overnight stays and 21,000 day visits. Dutton's appointment in December to a Chamber of Commerce committee tasked with offering help to the Mayor for the influenza situation in Seattle likely reflects positively on his management of his many civic projects during this challenging time, including the Christian Science Soldiers' and Sailors' Hospitality Club.<sup>43</sup>

Immediately after the ban on public gatherings was lifted at the end of November, Third Church along with all the other Seattle branches put on two well-publicized Christian Science lectures, as their way of "offering at this time the healing and constructive message of Christian Science."<sup>44</sup>

In the Christian Science periodicals, among the thousands of testimonies of healings published, there are many hundreds that mention healings of influenza. About two hundred specify or indicate Spanish flu, several from the Seattle area. These personal stories were published during or immediately following the pandemic, over the next few years, and over many decades afterward. What is most remarkable about their stories is the quickness of their cure. Testifiers often stated that they had neither long recovery and nor any lingering "after-effects." They were well in a few days, two days, one day, overnight, a few hours, one hour, even a few minutes, or less. Sometimes they described the healing as instantaneous.<sup>45</sup>

One of the first published, in the January 4, 1919, issue of the *Sentinel*, was a dramatic story from a soldier at Camp Dodge, the Army base in Iowa featured in the *Monitor* dispatch. Marven L. Scranton recounted defending himself from an influenza attack through prayer. His experience was perhaps part of the basis for the famous claims of immunity of the Christian Scientists:

I had seen several of my comrades walk out of rank, fall over, and be carried to the hospital overcome by the disease; so when I began to feel ill, fear overwhelmed me with the suggestion that I was getting it. We were all out on reveille formation one morning when everything seemed to get black before my eyes and I could scarcely stand alone, so stood there leaning on my rifle. I was gradually becoming unconscious when I heard some one, as though far away, telling me to move over and stand at attention, so I moved over and straightened up the best I could, all the time declaring the truth. Within fifteen minutes everything cleared up, the cloud lifted, and I was completely healed. . . . my quick delivery from the attack of influenza and the fear of death has caused me to be most grateful. At that time over half our company was in the hospital and very few escaped the disease entirely. That I was one of those who escaped I owe entirely to Christian Science.<sup>46</sup>

For several of the published healings it seems their condition was so severe that the testifiers described experiencing something like death prior to being healed. One testifier described becoming detached from her body, observing it from outside of it. Another wrote of waking in the night to the "sense of having been close to the shadow of death." This testifier then stated plainly, "My wife tells me that to mortal sense I had every appearance of one passing on." Another testifier wrote:

Upon the arrival of the practitioner I seemed to be passing through the belief of death—the last enemy to be overcome. To one who does not understand Christian Science it would seem a

miracle, but when we know that all things are possible to God, it no longer becomes one. I was brought back to life. . . . I fully realized that death is what Mrs. Eddy says it is . . . —“an illusion.”<sup>47</sup>

While most of the people who relied on Christian Science treatment were already familiar with it, for some it was their first experience with it. Some had Christian Science healings while under a medical doctor's care. Others called a Christian Scientist because no medical doctors were available to help them. Martin Verheul had lost confidence in his medical treatment:

We knew little of Christian Science in 1918 when the influenza epidemic struck our entire family. We called our family physician. The medicine he prescribed for me seemed to make me worse instead of better, and so I destroyed it all. We called a Christian Science practitioner for help for all of us, and we were healed. That was the end of material remedies in our home.<sup>48</sup>

Christian Science practitioners were available for help over the phone, but they often made home visits during the epidemic. One person told of a practitioner staying at her bedside for twelve hours one night. In a published testimony of healing of a “severe attack of influenza” by E. R. Cose, from East Aurora, NY, in expressing his appreciation for his quick, complete healing, wrote:

I am absolutely convinced that the Christian Science practitioners, in their consecration and vigil against the enemy, disease, are as truly soldiers as were our American boys on the firing line.<sup>49</sup>

Louis J. Scherz testified of being healed during a church service. Mr. Scherz had been struggling with influenza for two weeks. Since the services were suspended where he lived in Plainfield, New Jersey, despite not feeling well he traveled twenty-five miles to New York City to attend a Wednesday evening testimony meeting and a Christian Science lecture the next evening. “From that time I felt no further effects of the illness,” he wrote.<sup>50</sup>

The published testimonies are only representative of the healings that may have been shared at Wednesday church meetings. In a response to criticism from *The Christian Century* that Christian Science churches remaining open “was a discourtesy to the health authorities,” Ernest C. Moses of Chicago, Illinois, shared:

During the recent epidemic in this city alone, at the Wednesday evening testimony meetings of the Christian Science churches, fully attended throughout the epidemic period, hundreds of testimonies were given of the healing of cases of influenza. . . . These proofs of the healing power of God in Christian Science explain why Christian Scientists advocate that the “life interests of the people” require that civil authorities refrain from interference with the practice of religion, since the authorities rely upon medical advisers who prefer to work from the standpoint of fear of evil, rather than from the standpoint of faith in God.<sup>51</sup>

Presumably, a similar profusion of testimonies were being shared in every city where there were Christian Science churches. It would be difficult to even estimate how many people might have claimed healing of Spanish flu through Christian Science. Perhaps it could be said that, like the Apostle John's statement about the healing acts of Jesus, that “if they should be written every one, I suppose that even the world itself could not contain the books that should be written.” (John 21:25) But at least some attempt was made to count them in some areas when the practice of Christian Science healing was once again under attack.

With so many testimonies of healing of influenza published in the Christian Science periodicals and shared at churches, it might seem as though everyone who relied on Christian Science was healed, but unfortunately, not everyone recovered. One case of a boy who died under Christian Science treatment led to criminal charges for the Christian Scientists involved. Although this case was dismissed by the judge, the surrounding public controversy spurred Christian Scientists to publish statistics showing that the “morbidity . . . and mortality among Christian Scientists was not nearly so great as among others.” These figures published in local newspapers were republished in the *Sentinel*. The following letter by A. O. Freel in defense of Christian Science in the case of the boy who died was published in the *Oregonian*:

Because the methods employed by Christian Science in healing the sick do not happen to agree with the preconceived opinion of a judge in a police court about how the sick should be treated, is small reason for his accusing the Christian Science practitioner and the parents of a deceased boy of criminal neglect in the care and treatment of the boy, who is said to have died of influenza. The judge in dismissing the case is reported to have said that, in his opinion, the boy would not have died if he had received reasonable medical treatment.

In making this statement the judge is assuming an unenviable responsibility. Especially is this true as no evidence was introduced to show neglect in the care of the boy. Such a conclusion in this event could be arrived at only on the assumption that under "reasonable medical treatment" all similar cases of influenza recover. But such is not the case. Within a period of little more than a year, more than two thousand cases have proved fatal under medical treatment in Oregon.

In fact Christian Science treatment has proved itself to be many times more successful than has medical treatment in the healing of influenza wherever statistics have been gathered. As a fair example of the relative value of Christian Science treatment in healing influenza, the statistics from California are as follows:

In that state during the months from October, 1918, to March, 1919, inclusive, Christian Science practitioners treated 23,418 cases of influenza and pneumonia. Of this number 66 cases proved fatal, or about two and four-fifths fatal cases for each thousand cases reported. During the same period the figures compiled by the state board of health covering 305,856 cases show that of this number 20,904 were fatal. This shows a mortality of sixty-eight per thousand of all cases reported. In other words, Christian Science treatment in California proved itself to be about twenty-four times as successful as medical treatment in healing influenza and pneumonia during the epidemic last year. . . .<sup>52</sup>

In response to another “gratuitous fling at Christian Scientists” in a health officer’s report on the epidemic Albert F. Gilmore shared his New York statistics in the *Rochester Times-Union*:

Careful investigation in the city of Rochester reveals the fact that of the two hundred and eight cases of influenza in which Christian Science treatment was resorted to, but one resulted fatally. In the light of the utter failure of the medical profession to check in any degree this epidemic until it had spread through every section of our country, and that it did finally literally "burn itself out,"—to quote a leading medical journal,—it is not exactly easy to understand where a medical practitioner can find warrant for attacking another system of healing which had, in the case of the epidemic, a notably successful record.<sup>53</sup>

Hugh S. Hughes, Jr., shared these Wisconsin figures in the *Milwaukee Sentinel*:



[S]tatistics in Wisconsin show that over six per cent of the cases under medical treatment were fatal, while statistics gathered from forty-five cities in Wisconsin, including Milwaukee, show that under Christian Science only two-tenths of one per cent were fatal.<sup>54</sup>

John Randall Dunn cited an article in an unnamed Midwestern newspaper as his source for these figures:

[N]ational statistics covering the influenza epidemic of 1918 show that while one in every sixteen cases under medical treatment passed on, under Christian Science care only one case out of every five hundred and thirteen proved fatal.<sup>55</sup>

While some medical doctors might find these undocumented statistics questionable and continue to equate reliance on Christian Science treatment to negligence, it is unquestionable that the influenza pandemic did not hinder the popularity of Christian Science as a treatment of disease, as the number of professional practitioners continued increasing. At least some in the medical field recognized the influence of fear as harmful. The State Board of Health in Nevada was quoted from a report on the epidemic as concluding:

The quarantine and mask questions [for Spanish influenza] have both been tried; neither one has proved successful . . . there can be no question of doubt but that fear so reduced the powers of resistance that many became easy victims, and "fear" should have been entered in the death certificate as the remote cause of death.<sup>56</sup>

Regardless of whether one might fault the Christian Scientists who challenged the ban on church services, as a result of this global health emergency, the growth of the Christian Science movement only accelerated. The Christian Science Committee on Publication of Colorado as quoted in the *Sentinel* noted an overall benefit from the pandemic experience in the level of dedication among its adherents:

The epidemic of fear, spoken of as the "flu," which was spread by and in mortal mind on the wings of suggestion, forced Christian Scientists to more consecrated effort, with generally favorable results, and afforded opportunities to the committee on publication for voicing the truth through the press, thereby calling the attention of the public to the only antidote for fear; namely, divine Love and its ever operative law. . . .<sup>57</sup>

Eddy's words written in 1899, must have rung especially true to Christian Scientists who served in the emergency hospitals in 1918:

Beloved Christian Scientists, keep your minds so filled with Truth and Love, that sin, disease, and death cannot enter them. It is plain that nothing can be added to the mind already full. There is no door through which evil can enter, and no space for evil to fill in a mind filled with goodness. Good thoughts are an impervious armor; clad therewith you are completely shielded from the attacks of error of every sort. And not only yourselves are safe, but all whom your thoughts rest upon are thereby benefited.<sup>58</sup>

Applying this sentiment to the pandemic in his 1919 article "Influence" in the *Sentinel* Horace C. Jenkins wrote:

We may always rejoice that the seeming affliction is simply an opportunity to prove to a watching world, weary with the long night of cruel dreams, that the image and likeness of God, the real man, is free from all malign influences. Gratitude and joy clothe man with invincible armor. Jesus expressed gratitude for the assurance of the uninterrupted operation of Principle even before he commanded Lazarus to awaken from that deep sleep called death; and equally striking was his

insistence on the necessity for joy even on the part of those above whose material perception he was about to ascend. Such gratitude and joy must be included in the equipment of each one who has enlisted to help “reinstate primitive Christianity and its lost element of healing” (Manual, p. 17). A Christian Scientist may, therefore, rightfully claim exemption from being influenzaed, for he is daily seeking and finding refuge from all erroneous influences “in the secret place of the most High,” in whom “we live, and move, and have our being.”<sup>59</sup>

In Detroit, Michigan, where for at least one Sunday the Christian Scientists apparently successfully held church services despite a local ban, even a critical commentator expressed the spirit of Eddy’s teachings when he wrote in the *Detroit Times*:

The evening following the issuance of the health commissioner's edict against the Spanish influenza, the avenues in the vicinity of every Christian Science church in Detroit were fairly choked with the motor cars of the communicants of this faith. Being exempted by religious scruples from service in the fight with material weapons against epidemic, this flourishing church filled its sanctuaries, quite oblivious of trepidation about overcrowded meeting places. The Christian Scientists not only deny bodily ills, but they deny microbes admittance to their prayer meetings by filling them so full there isn't room left for a germ to edge in.<sup>60</sup>

Medical experts at the time were concerned that until a vaccine was found Spanish flu would continue to afflict people, but in fact the epidemic came to an end. Whether the influenza simply burned itself out, as some suggested, or the Christian Scientists succeeded in rising in “consciousness to the true sense of the omnipotence of Life, Truth, and Love,” as Eddy had instructed, in 1919 this most deadly form of influenza disappeared from among the human race as suddenly and as mysteriously as it had appeared.<sup>61</sup>

The pandemic was fading when two Christian Science churches held dedication services for their new buildings. The special Easter Sunday services in Rockford, Illinois, “attended by an assemblage that filled the auditorium,” and Edmonton, Alberta, Canada, were “occasion for rejoicing among the local Christian Scientists.” Likewise were they cause for joy by those all around the world when the *Christian Science Sentinel* printed their dedication announcements.<sup>62</sup>

In Seattle at Third Church of Christ, Scientist, which was still holding its services in a rented hall in the University National Bank Building, the members were inspired to begin their construction project on their lot on “Greek Row.” Just before Easter Sunday 1919, there would be a membership motion to move forward with church building, thus launching a city-wide building boom of Christian Science churches that did not stop until there was one built in nearly every district in the city.

In regards to the influenza, in official church records at Third Church, there was never any mention of anything about it in any of their meeting minutes. It is unclear whether any meetings were ever held on how to handle the closure order. Their internal records, which detailed so many operations of the church, left no record of any discussion. No special tributes were made nor any memorial events officially organized. It was almost as though to them the pandemic never happened.

---

<sup>1</sup> *Building project meetings suspended*: Board Minutes, Apr. 2, 1918, 60. 03ChSea.

<sup>2</sup> “influencing or being influenced erroneously”: Eddy, *Man.*, 40; “mean not to catch or pass on”: Horace C. Jenkins, “Influence,” *CSS*, Aug. 9, 1919.

---

<sup>3</sup> “Unknown Disease Spreads in Spain,” *ST*, May 28, 1918, 15; John Caldbick, “Flu in Washington: The 1918 ‘Spanish Flu’ Pandemic,” HistoryLink.org Essay 20300, Mar. 23, 2017.

<sup>4</sup> “one of the most distinguished members of his profession”: “Eminent Doctor Reaches Seattle,” *ST*, June 16, 1915, 2; “Michigan Deans to Be Given Banquet,” *ST*, Apr. 10, 1910, 4.

<sup>5</sup> “If the epidemic continues its mathematical rate” and “The saddest part of my life” and “compelled him to question his very faith”: “Biography: Victor Vaughan,” PBS.org, undated. Accessed May 2, 2020; Walter L Bierring, M.D., “Biography of Victor C. Vaughan, Sixty-sixth President of the A.M.A.” in *A history of the American Medical Association 1847 to 1947* by Morris Fishbein, M.D., Vaughan.org; “Victor C. Vaughan,” Wikipedia.org, accessed May 2, 2020.

<sup>6</sup> Katie Vloet notes the irony that Victor C. Vaughan wrote only a few paragraphs on the 1918 influenza pandemic in his 500-page memoir. Attributing the omission to emotional scars and haunting memories, Vloet quotes Gina Kolata, author of *Flu: The Story of the Influenza Pandemic of 1918 and the Search for the Virus that Caused It*, (2001): “If anyone might be expected to write about the epidemic, it was Vaughan. He was an epidemiologist, one whose professional life centered on understanding the causes and courses of disease, and a medical professional who had been a witness to one of the worst epidemics ever to strike the face of the earth,” Kolata wrote. “But instead of dealing with the plague, he seemed almost compelled to quickly give a nod to it and then move on to something easier to talk about.” Katie Vloet, “This Infection, Like War, Kills the Young,” *Medicine at Michigan*, medicineatmichigan.org, Fall 2018 (accessed May 21, 2020).

<sup>7</sup> “At a time of contagious disease”: Eddy, *My*, 116. This is the beginning of her article “Personal Contagion,” *CSS*, July 7, 1906, later republished in *The First Church of Christ, Scientist, and Miscellany*.

<sup>8</sup> “If only the people would believe”: Eddy, “Contagion,” *MW*, 229.

<sup>9</sup> 9 years, and “incomparably better”: “Selected Articles,” Henry Dickinson, *CSS*, Nov. 21, 1931; “mental factor in disease” and “a mental origin” and “Christian Science does not depend on any power”: “Electrical Transcription No. 2: Interview with Walton Hubbard, M.D.,” a 1933 pamphlet reprinted in *CSS*, Oct. 1, 2013; “cases which were hopelessly incurable”: “The Lectures: Spokane, Wash.,” *CSS*, July 31, 1915.

<sup>10</sup> Seattle-area lectures by Dr. Walton Hubbard, C.S.B. included The Ray Theater in Olympia on Sept. 5, 1918 and Princess Theatre in Ballard in Seattle, Sept. 12, 1916: Ad, *Washington Standard* (Olympia, WA), Aug. 30, 1918, 8; Ad, *ST*, Sept. 11, 1916, 20; “The statement that ‘the germ theory’”: “Selected Articles,” Robert G. Steel, *CSS*, Dec. 28, 1918; John B. Fraser’s experiments were also mentioned in “Signs of the Times,” *CSS*, Aug. 9, 1919. From *Rocky Mountain News*, Denver, Colorado.

<sup>11</sup> “it is interesting to note that Dr. F. L. Kelly”: “Selected Articles,” Peter V. Ross, *CSS*, Mar. 29, 1919.

<sup>12</sup> “Signs of the Times,” *CSS*, Apr. 12, 1919. From *Oakland Enquirer*.

<sup>13</sup> *Plain Dealer*: “Signs of the Times,” *CSS*, July 12, 1919; *NY Herald*: “Signs of the Times,” *CSS*, Mar. 15, 1919; See also “How did Christian Scientists respond to the 1918-1919 Spanish flu?” MBEL blog post, Apr. 9, 2020.

<sup>14</sup> “an iron, health-minded fist”: Nicholas Deshais, “When the Pandemic Came to Spokane – 102 Years Ago,” NWNewsNetwork.org; *Spokane context*: “Spokane, Washington,” *Influenza Encyclopedia: The American Influenza Epidemic of 1918-1918*, InfluenzaArchive.org; *Dr. Fluno lecture*: “The Lectures: A Spokane Wash.,” *CSS*, June 29, 1899; *Dr. Sulzer lecture*: “The Lectures: At Spokane, Wash.,” *CSS*, May 23, 1901; “engaged in the healing of the sick” and “could not consider the character or purpose”: “One Death, 53 New ‘Flu’ Cases,” *Spokesman Review*, Oct. 17, 1918; “Lion Hotel Will House Patients With Influenza,” *Spokesman Review*, Oct. 16, 1918; Richard Mather, “Spirituality: The Weapon that Never Fails,” *CSJ*, Jan 2002; “an appeal was made to the Christian Scientists” and “scrubbing floors and doing any work”: “Christian Science Lecture by Dr. Walton Hubbard, C.S.B.” *Gross Pointe [MI] News*, November 4, 1948; “for the splendid aid rendered”: *Christian Science War Time Activities*, Christian Science Publishing Society, 1922, 362.

<sup>15</sup> *Great Lakes*: “Selected Articles,” Robert G. Steel, *CSS*, Dec. 28, 1918; *Christian Science War Time Activities*, CSPA, 1922, 151; 4200 cases, 50 tents: “Extracts from Reports Relative to Influenza, Pneumonia, and Respiratory Diseases,” V1. Camp Mills Base Hospital Report, U.S. Army Medical Dept., Office of Medical History, Army.mil, accessed May 7, 2020; testimony, Zona M. Carruthers, *CSS*, May 12, 1923.

<sup>16</sup> “I helped to nurse five”: testimony, Myra Atkinson, *CSJ*, Apr. 1920; testimony, Miss Mary E. Moser, *CSS*, Sept. 23, 1922.

<sup>17</sup> “great mass of evidence accumulated” and “One of the things”: *Christian Science War Time Activities*, CSPA, 1922, 331.

---

<sup>18</sup> "Upon reporting to the Commandant": *Christian Science War Time Activities*, CSPS, 1922, 152-3.

<sup>19</sup> "The utterly helpless attitude of the health authorities": "From the Press," CSS, Oct. 26, 1918.

<sup>20</sup> "Fear is the most prolific source of all evil": "A Mad World," *Washington Herald*, Oct. 19, 1918, 5. Reprinted from CSM, Oct. 8, 1918, 16. This editorial was widely republished. This *Washington Herald* version included comment from Avery Coonley, Christian Science Committee on Publication.

<sup>21</sup> "Surely it was a wise man" and "It is hoped that by recalling": "A Mad World," *Washington Herald*, Oct. 19, 1918, 5.

<sup>22</sup> "Rarely is one allowed the doubtful privilege": "Selected Articles," Robert G. Steel, CSS, Dec. 28, 1918.

<sup>23</sup> "If the Bible is true": "Selected Articles," John M. Dean, CSS, Dec. 7, 1918.

<sup>24</sup> "the only thing we have to fear is fear itself": Franklin D. Roosevelt, First Inaugural Address, Mar. 4, 1933; Witte: 1919 Des Moines Polk City Directory, 1329; "Many people have thought themselves into their graves": "Campaign Against Fear is Advocated," CSM, Oct. 22, 1918, 6; "Fear Causes 'Flu,' Fighters Declare," *Washington Times*, Oct. 30, 1918, 3; Judge Clifford P Smith, CSS, March 8, 1919.

<sup>25</sup> "that newspapers prepare editorials" and "was endorsed by the committee": "Signs of the Times," CSS, Dec. 14, 1918; "Fear Responsible for Spread of Influenza," *Washington Herald*, Oct. 30, 1918, 3; Byers: 1921 Des Moines Polk City Directory, 237; 1920 US Census: Webster, Polk, Iowa; Roll: T625\_507; Pg: 16A; ED: 187.

<sup>26</sup> "Many a hopeless case of disease is induced": Eddy, S&H, 196-7; "Looking over the newspapers of the day": Eddy, MW, 7; "We should master fear": Eddy, S&H, 197.

<sup>27</sup> "Fear Responsible for Spread of Influenza," *Washington Herald*, Oct. 30, 1918, 3; "Anti Fear Campaign Urged by [Christian] Scientists," *East Oregonian*, Nov. 1, 1918, 4; "Quit Thinking about Influenza," *Exira* (Iowa), Oct. 24, 1918; "Fear Causes 'Flu,' Fighters Declare," *Washington Times*, Oct. 30, 1918, 3; "Princeton Churches, Etc. Closed," *Princeton Union*, Oct. 31, 1918, 4; "Christian Scientists and the Influenza," *Colville Examiner*, Nov. 9, 1918, 8; "Newspapers Requested to Oppose Fear," *Daily Alaskan*, Nov. 19, 1918, 2; "Campaign Against Fear is Advocated," *Lincoln County Times*, Nov. 21, 1918, 1; "At the very moment when the churches should be": "Has the World Gone Mad?" (Ad), *Daily East Oregonian*, Oct. 31, 1918, 6.

<sup>28</sup> "disease . . . being so industriously promoted": "Resolution, addressed to City Council, Los Angeles, written by First Church of Christ, Scientist," Oct. 11, 1918; "The efficacy of Christian Science to prevent and heal disease": "Petition Sent to Mayor George L. Baker by Committee Representing All the Christian Science Churches and Society in Portland, Oregon," 1. George Luis Baker Subject Files, 1918. Both previous sources are from *Influenza Encyclopedia*. Published: Ann Arbor, Michigan: Michigan Publishing, University Library, University of Michigan, ([influenzaarchive.org](http://influenzaarchive.org)).

<sup>29</sup> Other cities where Christian Science churches petitioned city councils include Spokane, Washington, (as mentioned earlier in this article) and Melbourne, Australia, according to Paul Jones, of Burwood, Australia in a letter in CSJ, Apr. 2002.

<sup>30</sup> "I want it distinctly understood": "Must Follow Health Rule Says Mayor," *Los Angeles Evening Herald*, Nov. 2, 1918, 3.

<sup>31</sup> When First Church of Christ, Scientist, Los Angeles held opening services in 1901 it was the first Christian Science church edifice in the "the southern metropolis of the golden state." Both Dr. Fluno and Dr. Sulcer sat on the platform and participated in conducting the service, during which it was emphasized that the grand edifice was quickly built through the gratitude of people healed of "all manner of diseases. . . who for the most part were hopeless cases of the regular medical practitioner, were restored to pristine health and morals through Christian Science," as recounted in "Opening of First Church of Christ, Scientist, of Los Angeles, Cal," CSJ, Dec. 1901.

<sup>32</sup> "travelling in a slow stream": "Defy 'Flu' Rule; Arrested," *Los Angeles Times*, Nov. 4, 1918, 1; "Church Heads May Carry 'Flu' Fight to Highest Court," *Los Angeles Evening Herald*, Nov. 5, 1918, 7; "technically arrested": "U.S. May Hear Church Fight on 'Flu Law,'" *Los Angeles Herald*, Nov. 5, 1918, 3; \$5 bail: news clipping from *InfluenzaEncyclopedia.com* labeled as (unable to verify) "Goes to Jail to Test 'Flu' Closing," *Los Angeles Evening Herald*, Nov. 4, 1918, 3; "Christian Scientists Arrested as They Attempt Service," *Seattle Star*, Nov. 4, 1918, 5; "Christian Scientists Arrested for Violating Influenza Ban," *ST*, Nov. 4, 1918, 7; "Flu Costs Million A Day in the U.S.," *Seattle Star*, Dec. 28, 1918, 2; "Selected Articles," Robert G. Steel, CSS, May 31, 1919; "Selected Articles," Robert G. Steel, CSS, June 21, 1919.

---

<sup>33</sup> I did not find a conclusive report on how the Ninth Church of Christ, Scientist, Los Angeles, legal case was ultimately resolved. My description is based on these articles:

Dec. 28, 1918, *Seattle Star*: "Judge White decided the law was unconstitutional."

May 31, 1919, CSS: "That such action is well taken is shown in a widely published dispatch from Los Angeles, California, where a closing order issued against the churches by the board of health was recently declared by the court to be unreasonable, invalid, and unconstitutional."

June 21, 1919, CSS: "A day or two before the matter was to be finally disposed of, the judge having the case under advisement indicated in a newspaper interview that he would hold the closing order invalid. On the day set for the hearing, the judge was prevented from holding court, but the authorities promptly rescinded the closing order. The intimation evidently was sufficient."

<sup>34</sup> "to test the legality of the restriction" and "Christian Scientists . . . are not without sympathy": Ernest C. Moses, CSS, Apr. 26, 1919.

<sup>35</sup> "Signs of the Times," CSS, Nov. 30, 1918. (From *Public Ledger*, Philadelphia, PA); "Held Church While 'Flu' Ban Was On; Is Fined in Court," *Seattle Star*, Jan. 13, 1919, 12.

<sup>36</sup> "When the order came that, on account of an epidemic" and "In great gladness of heart": Maude M. Greene, "A Personal Experience," CSS, Mar. 22, 1919.

<sup>37</sup> "The outstanding feature of the discussion": John Caldbick, "Flu in Washington: The 1918 'Spanish Flu' Pandemic," HistoryLink.org Essay 20300, Mar. 23, 2017. Caldbick cites as source *State of Washington Twelfth Biennial Report of the State Board of Health* (Olympia: Frank M. Lamborn, Public Printer, 1919), 23, available at InfluenzaEncyclopedia.org accessed Mar. 22, 2017; "Seattle and a Past Pandemic," WSU Press, Mar. 13, 2020, from *Eccentric Seattle*, J. Kingston Pierce, 2003.

<sup>38</sup> "the army of men working in the shipyards" and "patriotic duty" and "intelligent and conscientious": "Seattle to Make Fight on Disease," *ST*, Oct. 5, 1918, 1, 3.

<sup>39</sup> "Influenza Squad": "Influenza Squad" is widely quoted in articles about the 1918 pandemic in Seattle, but its source is not widely cited. The term came to my attention from Knute Berger, "Before Coronavirus: How Seattle Handled the Spanish Flu," Crosscut.com, Mar. 4, 2020. "Seattle, Washington," InfluenzaEncyclopedia.org, cites "Three deaths from Influenza," *Seattle P-I*, Oct. 9, 1918, 1; "Seattle churches unhesitatingly will obey" and "expressed their intention to comply cheerfully" and "Christian Scientists are, first of all, obedient": "Churches to Conduct Services in Open Air," *ST*, Oct. 6, 1918, 12.

<sup>40</sup> "great patriotic-religious gathering": "Churches to Conduct Services in Open Air," *ST*, Oct. 6, 1918, 12; "rather small": "Open-Air Services Held By Churches," *ST*, Oct. 7, 1918, 7; "common thought" and "was that more severe scourges" and "attendance ran from a couple of hundred": "Churches Meet Quarantine Order: Mass Celebrated in Open Because of Epidemic," *Catholic Northwest Progress* (Seattle, WA), Oct. 11, 1918, 1.

<sup>41</sup> "the clergy did not want to keep the members standing": "Open-Air Services Held By Churches," *ST*, Oct. 7, 1918, 7; "Scores of clergymen": "Total of 1,921 Flu Cases in Seattle Now" (under subhead "Churches Closed"), *Seattle Star*, Oct. 12, 1918, 2.

<sup>42</sup> "take charge of the Camp Welfare Work": Board minutes, 03ChSea, July 2, 1918, 74; *More Homes Bureau*: "Want Lot Owners Registered," *ST*, Aug 23, 1918, 16; "Attack Housing Job With Full Authority," *ST*, Sept. 25, 1918, 13; "present to Christian Scientists and their friends": Ad, SS, Sept. 28, 1918, 2; *Independent*: "Church Not Financing Club," *ST*, Oct. 17, 1918, 10; "unoccupied for some time": "Unidentified Men Fire at Officials," *ST*, Oct. 7, 1918, 11; "Scientists to Open Service Men's Club," SS, Oct. 5, 1918, 9; "night-and-day operation": "Club Ends Labor," *ST*, Mar. 30, 1919, 15; "a simple, plain, comfortable place": "Christian Scientists Plan Clubhouse for Soldiers," *ST*, Sept. 30, 1918, 20; "The Soldiers' and Sailors' Hospitality Club," Ad, *ST*, Nov. 3, 1918, 7.

<sup>43</sup> "fired pointblank" and "passed about a foot above the heads": "Unidentified Men Fire at Officials," *ST*, Oct. 7, 1918, 11; 18 weeks, statistics: "Club Ends Labor," *ST*, Mar. 30, 1919, 15.

<sup>44</sup> "offering at this time the healing": Ad, *ST*, Nov. 12, 1918, 18.

<sup>45</sup> About 200 testimonies: Determined by searching a digital edition of the Christian Science periodicals (JSH-Online) for relevant terms, including Spanish, influenza, flu, epidemic, 1918, and 1919.

---

<sup>46</sup> *"I had seen several of my comrades walk out of rank"*: testimony, Marven L. Scranton, CSS, Jan. 4, 1919; testimony, Edna Saint, CSS, May 10, 1930.

<sup>47</sup> *"sense of having been close to the shadow of death"* and *"My wife tells me"*: testimony, Harry Rix, CSS, July 12, 1919; *"Upon the arrival of the practitioner"*: testimony, Blanche McCulloch, CSS, Apr. 19, 1919; *"an illusion"*: Eddy, *S&H*, 584 (definition of "Death").

<sup>48</sup> *"We knew little of Christian Science in 1918"*: testimony, Eunice and Martin Verheul, CSS, Dec. 3, 1960.

<sup>49</sup> *12 hours*: testimony, Louise Beemer Holeman, CSS, Jan. 10, 1920; *"severe attack of influenza"* and *"I am absolutely convinced"*: testimony, E.R. Cose, CSS, Mar. 4, 1922.

<sup>50</sup> *"From that time I felt no further effects"*: testimony, Louis J. Scherz, CSJ, May 1923.

<sup>51</sup> *"was a discourtesy to the health authorities"* and *"During the recent epidemic in this city alone"*: "Selected Articles," Ernest C. Moses, CSS, May 17, 1919. Reprinted from *The Christian Century*.

<sup>52</sup> *"morbidity . . . and mortality among Christian Scientists"*: "Selected Articles," Aaron E. Brandt, CSS, May 3, 1919. Quote from *The Dispatch*, Pittsburgh, PA; *"Because the methods employed by Christian Science"*: "Selected Articles," A. O. Freel, CSS, June 26, 1920.

<sup>53</sup> *"gratuitous fling at Christian Scientists"* and *"Careful investigation in the city of Rochester"*: "Selected Articles," Albert F. Gilmore, CSS, Apr. 5, 1919.

<sup>54</sup> *"[S]tatistics in Wisconsin show"*: "Selected Articles," Hugh S. Hughes, Jr., CSS, Aug 28, 1920.

<sup>55</sup> John Randall Dunn, "Claim Man's Immunity from Epidemics!" CSS, Jan. 18, 1947.

<sup>56</sup> *"The quarantine and mask questions"*: "Signs of the Times," "From Biennial Report, State Board of Health, Nevada," CSS, Apr. 12, 1919.

<sup>57</sup> *"The epidemic of fear, spoken of as the 'flu,'"*: "Among the Churches: Current Notes: Colorado," CSS, June 21, 1919.

<sup>58</sup> *"Beloved Christian Scientists"*: Eddy, "What Our Leader Says," *My.*, 210. First appeared in Feb. 9, 1899, CSS.

<sup>59</sup> *"We may always rejoice"*: Horace C. Jenkins, "Influence," CSS, Aug. 9, 1919.

<sup>60</sup> *"The evening following the issuance"*: "Signs of the Times," CSS, Nov. 30, 1918.

<sup>61</sup> *Quick/mysterious disappearance*: "The worldwide epidemic lasts for about a year, killing an estimated 20 million persons, then vanishes as strangely as it had appeared": "1918: A fateful Ending," The History Place: World War I, [historyplace.com/worldhistory/firstworldwar/index-1918.html](http://historyplace.com/worldhistory/firstworldwar/index-1918.html) (accessed May 21, 2020); "Then, to Vaughan's relief, influenza seemed to slip away as mysteriously as it had arrived": "Biography: Victor Vaughan," American Experience, PBS.org (accessed May 21, 2020); "Yet almost as quickly and mysteriously as it raced around the continents, the flu pandemic subsided in 1919 and officially ended in 1920": Katie Vloet, "This Infection, Like War, Kills the Young," Medicine at Michigan, [MedicineAtMichigan.org](http://MedicineAtMichigan.org) (accessed May 21, 2020); "The Spanish Flu disappeared almost as quickly as it appeared and has yet to reappear with such intensity": "Influenza Pandemic," University of Washington Libraries website, [lib.washington.edu](http://lib.washington.edu).

<sup>62</sup> *"attended by an assemblage"* and *"occasion for rejoicing among the local Christian Scientists"*: "Among the Churches," CSS, June 21, 1919.